

## Chapter- 5

### Summary and Implications

---

International comparative analysis of Policing is a difficult task for various reasons. Nonetheless, it has been a technique of inquiry throughout the social sciences. It has only been lately that it has aroused interest among the criminologists and police-academics. It being a relatively new and less researched subject, imposes an obvious limitation of availability of literature. Other difficulties that this kind of study pose is the wide range of aspects that moulds the policing structure and its responses in any society. Each aspect becomes a subject matter of research in itself. 'One size fits all', certainly is not applicable in Policing. From a personal perspective, while writing this dissertation, it added to my feelings of inadequacy, time and again.

At the same time, there are considerable advantages of comparative studies, both theoretical and practical. Essentially, such analysis allows us to see beyond our own direct experiences and challenges 'taken for granted'. The history of police development is a story of learning from the experiences of police systems elsewhere. In the literature, British and US models are often contrasted with continental and colonial systems. These models may not be any more relevant in current times and there is a need for evolving alternate models.

#### Historical Evolution and Beyond

As noted in previous chapters, the formal policing in India evolved during the British regime and was a colonial model. 'The hang-over of the British days was a unitary police

force in the country though under the control of each state. The possibility of more than one police force operating in the same geographical area, each in its own specialized sphere, was an unknown thesis even though quite common in several countries. In the USA, for example, there are nearly forty thousand separate police forces, several working in the same area. The number of forces functioning in New York, for example is quite large and some forces cater merely for a small neighborhood' (Trilok Nath 1978).

Indian police have also developed specialized units over a period of time. However, these specialized police units have been raised by the central government. The provincial governments have raised specialized units from within the 'unitary police force' either by increasing the overall strength of the provincial police or by diverting the resources from within. There are very few provinces who have created 'new' specialized force and one such example is 'Grey Hounds' created by Andhra Pradesh for a special purpose to fight naxalism. The leadership of this force has, though, been the same as for the overall provincial force.

There is no example of Municipal Police in India. The police functions, may it be crime control or traffic regulation, continues to be under the unitary command of provincial government. The arguments given against such transfer of Police functions at Municipal level are immaturity of 'local' or municipal governance. The argument has its merit keeping the fact in mind that the 'local' governance (often termed as third tier of governance) got constitutional status as late as 1992. The 'local' or Municipal governance is struggling to mature and stabilize since then.

It can be said that Indian police still continues to be under the colonial hang-over, but is progressing towards a hybrid system between US and UK.

### **Tactical dilemmas- Can Public Confidence be Improved?**

While the police forces of all the countries have the public trust and confidence issues, it runs much deeper in the case of Indian police. We have already discussed reasons for that in earlier chapters. Empirical evidence shows that the impact of police activity on overall crime rates is rather small and that the police officers spend a large proportion of their time dealing with non-crime-related events and circumstances. 'The police remain, to this day, the secret social service' – Punch 1979.

The police leadership needs to take a conscientious call, taking the political masters, the media and other opinion makers into confidence, whether they should concentrate their efforts on 'getting-results' or on finding a better way of making the officers who report to them, treat people more fairly? A debate needs to be generated on the extent of emphasis on the crime data. Police needs to take its own legitimacy seriously, which can be better enhanced by building of policing relationships with individuals and communities. In the past few-years in England and Wales, despite political turbulence, 'confidence', as measured by the 'good job question', has slowly been rising (Flatley *et al.*2010, p.120). The Indian police can draw lessons from the same and can adopt the practices (that are relevant in Indian context) carried out by England and Wales police. Here, a word of caution is felt necessary against the symbolic community police programs/ interaction which are done once in a while with pomp and show. Instead, there is a need for police officers to consistently do the right thing in low-visibility settings when the only witness to the encounter is the member of the public on the receiving end of their action.

Police managers and policy-makers should lay strong incentive to improve the fairness and transparency of police/public interaction. This requires a need for a more honest look at the resistance of internal police cultures to such change. The empirical evidence shows that fairness is linked to cooperation, compliance and public engagement with police and other legal authorities. Various studies show that change to the internal police culture takes much longer than any academic might think. But one key and persistent finding, in both US and UK, is that police officers should treat the public with dignity and respect. This in itself is desirable and perhaps better for democracy which could initiate a more robust feedback loop that reflects on the legitimacy.

### **Technology as a Reform Vehicle**

A major and significant mechanism to reform is the modernization of police organization. Technology facilitates better management, supervision, control system, upgradation of personnel skills and work culture. The need to collect, collate and analyze vast amount of data is not only necessary for efficiency and performance of police but also integral to police work. Police are a vast information generating, processing and disseminating institution. Despite the best efforts of the National Crime Record Bureau (NCRB) to collect, collate and disseminate data at the national level, the utility of the same leaves much to be desired.

The government of India has embarked on an ambitious project named Crime and Criminal Tracking Network & Systems (CCTNS). It is conceived in the light of experience of a non-plan scheme namely - Common Integrated Police Application (CIPA). CCTNS is a Mission Mode Project under the National e-Governance Plan of

Govt of India. CCTNS aims at creating a comprehensive and integrated system for enhancing the efficiency and effectiveness of policing through adopting of principle of e-Governance and creation of a nationwide networking infrastructure for evolution of IT-enabled-state-of-the-art tracking system around 'Investigation of crime and detection of criminals'. The objectives of the Scheme are to make the Police functioning citizen friendly and more transparent by automating the functioning of Police Stations, improve delivery of citizen-centric services through effective usage of ICT, provide the Investigating Officers of the Civil Police with tools, technology and information to facilitate investigation of crime and detection of criminals, improve Police functioning in various other areas such as Law and Order, Traffic Management etc., facilitate Interaction and sharing of Information among Police Stations, Districts, State/UT headquarters and other Police Agencies, assist senior Police Officers in better management of Police Force, keep track of the progress of Cases, including in Courts, reduce manual and redundant Records keeping.

Under the CCTNS Project, approx. 14,000 Police Stations throughout the country has been proposed to be automated beside 6000 higher offices in police hierarchy e.g. Circles, Sub-Divisions, Districts, Range, Zones, Police Headquarters, SCRBx including scientific and technical organizations having databases required for providing assistance and information for investigation and other purposes e.g. Finger Print Bureaux, Forensic Labs etc.

While the CCTNS is in advance stage, there is a need to improvise it to make more and more user friendly. There is a need to develop tools that can generate various reports and analyze data at the back end, in variety of ways and in testing different theories and

concepts through simulations. Here, there is a need to draw lesson from the COMSTAT applied by the New York police in preventing and reducing crime.

### **GIS- COMPSTAT**

Crime analysis involves looking for patterns and matching the suspects to the incidents. A powerful tool called Geographical Information System (GIS) has been invented, which assists in analyzing spatial dimensions of the criminal incidents. GIS enables the investigator to combine spatial dimension of the crime to those of victim, offender and target dimensions (Verma: 2005).

The offenders choose their targets carefully taking into account the opportunity as well as the presence of police or other inhibiting factors. There are many criminogenic attractors (e.g. liquor shops, expensive shopping places, location of banks, isolated residential areas, dark areas etc.) which present offenders' opportunity to commit crime and 'gain' at such places. These places remain crime prone for a long period of time and are termed as 'hot-spots' of crime in criminology. GIS based crime-mapping enables the location of such hot spots and helps in analyzing them in terms of opportunities available for crime commission in those areas. By marking the location of the schools, shopping places, roads and residential areas it becomes possible to analyze the area, understand why crime was committed there and to devise preventive measures (Verma: 2005). It also helps to commit the limited resources more judiciously.

The success of NYPD came from the changes made by the police department under Commissioner Bratton and his team. They used COMPSTAT or computer-driven crime statistics for enforcing accountability and improving crime-fighting abilities by requiring

updated crime information, graphic crime mapping and revised crime strategies. At the police headquarters, everyday senior officers sat down with the precinct commanders (middle level managers) to analyze crime patterns of the previous day and the previous week and devise strategies to deal with them. Bratton empowered precinct commanders and encouraged street level creative problem solving by breaking old barriers in communications. Furthermore, all precinct commanders were made accountable for the errors in reporting. This crime information gathering was elevated from a clerical job to administrative obligation. By all these strategies the violent crime rates dropped by almost 40% during Bratton's period and so did other forms of crime. The success of this experiment was indeed the role that technology played in bringing vital information to the attention of police officers and helping them devise ways to combating the offenders. (Verma: 2005).

The Indian police can draw lessons from NYPD. There is a need to integrate the CCTNS data with such GIS at the back end and to generate the geo-spatial crime mapping. This will immensely help the police of respective districts to employ their resources judiciously.

#### **Need for a Statutory Body of Chief of Police**

The US Police felt the need to have a professional body of the Chiefs of Police as early as in 1893, and created a body under name International Association of Chiefs' of Police (IACP). The association's goals since then, are to advance the science and art of police services; to develop and disseminate improved administrative, technical and operational practices and promote their use in police work; to foster police cooperation and the

exchange of information and experience among police administrators throughout the world; to bring about recruitment and training in the police profession of qualified persons; and to encourage adherence of all police officers to high professional standards of performance and conduct.

Since 1893, the International Association of Chiefs of Police has been serving the needs of the law enforcement community. Throughout those past 100-plus years, it has been launching historically acclaimed programs, conducting ground-breaking research and providing exemplary programs and services to the membership across the globe.

Professionally recognized programs such as the FBI Identification Division and the Uniform Crime Records system can trace their origins back to the IACP. In fact, the IACP has been instrumental in forwarding breakthrough technologies and philosophies from the early years of its establishment to till now. From spearheading national use of fingerprint identification to partnering in a consortium on community policing to gathering top experts in criminal justice, the government and education for summits on violence, homicide, and youth violence, IACP has realized its responsibility to positively affect the goals of law enforcement.

Though, in India, police have a concept of an annual DGP/IGP conference (earlier it used to be twice a year), it has run into more a ritual than any meaningful exercise. The conference is convened by the Intelligence Bureau. There is no dedicated secretariat which can compile its recommendations and ensure follow up on its implementation. While police is a state subject and a state will be well within its right to accept or reject any of its recommendations. However, most of the recommendations relate to the police functioning and house-keeping within police and the state governments or government at



the center has neither any role nor any views. It is purely for the police leadership to carry the mantle and take these recommendations forward.

It is necessary that a permanent secretariat be set-up for the DGP/IGP conference wherein talent from police and academia is attracted to draw agenda and to pursue the recommendations. It is also necessary to change the nature of deliberations in this conference. A day should be devoted to listening to the presentation by the academics, who can give an outsider perspective and can bring on table the emerging trends of policing globally.

The police leadership needs to generate the interest of the parliament, politicians, social scientists and media on such conferences and shall bring the various issues, discussed and debated, in public domain for views and criticism. This will have two effects, one, it will generate debate among a larger population as a result police would get to know how common public views various issues. Secondly, it will put a pressure on police leadership to draft meaningful and people-centric agenda. It will also force the police leadership to pursue the recommendations more seriously.

### **The Structure of Indian Police: A case for Flattening of Hierarchy**

The policing has changed tremendously in last few decades. It is not the same for any country, developed or developing; a country with a colonial past or otherwise. In today's scenario, in some countries (mainly developed) the recorded crime is falling, workforce is shrinking and it is dealing with unprecedented demand. Much of the growing workload is not just solving crime, but public protection – dealing with domestic abuse, monitoring

high-risk violent criminals or sex offenders and vulnerable children, and being vigilant against the threat of terrorism.

Police officers and staff do a difficult job, and while there are some things from the past we should hold on to, we need to equip them with skills and knowledge to meet the challenges of the future. The prospect of a reducing workforce increases the size of the task.

One of the consequences is that there will inevitably be less supervision, and decisions will be made by those on the front line without checking with their bosses. This will increase the need for police officers to be skilled and autonomous. Officers need access to the evidence about what works in cutting crime, and to the training and information required to help them make decisions that in the past would have been left to those higher up the chain. It's part of the College of Policing's role to equip them with these tools.

Part of ensuring that the skill levels of officers are right for the roles they perform is recognizing what the equivalent education or qualification level should be in policing. There are many everyday situations in which police officers and staff are called upon to make judgments and exercise extraordinary professionalism. They need to have established qualification to be able to work alongside partner organizations, be that probation, local government, prisons, healthcare workers, academics or others.

Against a backdrop of increased autonomy, there is an opportunity to address the negative impact of the hierarchy that has sometimes characterized policing. Command and control can be necessary and effective in high-risk situations. As a default style of leadership, however, it can stifle the innovation and internal debate essential for

improving services. Unless we adapt our structures to lead appropriately to the context in which we are working, it will make the job more difficult.

It is likely that roles in policing will have to become increasingly specialized. A police constable has to be all things to all people, but the changing nature of crime is demanding specific skill sets to deal with particular problems. Policing the online world is a totally different challenge to what we faced before.

The recognition and reward of new and necessary skills, and a clear method of how we develop them, will be important for officers. A fresh look at the contribution made by police staff may also help shape the future of policing. Nothing can replace officers on the streets but there are hundreds of staff members across forces who do complex and important work in forensics, investigations, custody and many other roles. Defining and reforming the powers, they have could make a difference to the way in which forces can target their resources.

There is a need to shun the traditionalist approach and make policing more and more professional. With the special skills, the natural corollary will be the flattening of the hierarchy. There is a need to have a less hierarchical structure. The same is being done and debated in US and UK.

In India, it has been pointed out by various Commissions and Committees that civil police in India has been heavily manned by constabulary. As per 2013 Data on Police Organization, 85% of total civil police India is constabulary. There are many important reasons for which it has been pointed out that civil police in India needs to be more officer-oriented. At the same time, it has been observed that because of the above structure of police hierarchy combined with the system of direct recruitment at different

levels, there is large scale frustration among constabulary, and even in higher ranks of police, due to lack of timely promotion. Co-incidentally, both the hierarchal structure and lack of promotional avenues can be addressed through a single approach. The present bottom heavy civil police organization structure can be made narrower by restructuring relative strength at different levels, without increasing the total strength of police. It is possible to achieve this without compromising any of the functional requirements of the civil police. A mission mode study report was presented on this by Shri. D. M. Mitra wherein the same was recommended to the government of India.

His study, while discussing the level of direct entry, suggested that currently there are mainly four levels of entry into civil police viz. (i) Constable, (ii) Sub- Inspector, (iii) State Police Service and (iv) IPS. It was reflected in the study that "it is not possible to motivate the state governments to reduce the number of direct entrance levels. Therefore, ... -2/3<sup>rd</sup> of the total strength of sub inspector should be reserved for promoted officers; in the rank of DySP, a fixed number equivalent to 2.48% of the non-Direct IPS strength of state police should be the annual intake of direct DySP and rest vacancies should be reserved for promoted officers; further, the entry to IPS through promotional quota should continue as it is. The recommendation need to be seriously considered.

### **Police and Academic Linkages**

In doing a comparative study of Police (or for that matter any organization), either within the country with other provincial police or with international police forces, there is a dire need of base studies and base data on various parameters. Non-availability of base studies on various policing parameters is the biggest handicap in India. Somehow, both- the

police professionals as well as social scientists, have ignored this aspect. No serious studies have been taken by independent agencies on crime-victimization, criminology, responses of police in different scenario, perception vs. reality etc.

People don't believe the studies and data released by the police authorities themselves. Similarly, police find the reports of 'motivated' NGOs skewed and too scathing, most of the times. There is, thus, an imminent need for Indian police to have linkages with the universities and other academic bodies for evidence based policing. The independent research may be able to validate or otherwise various tools that police employee in the society.

There is a long-standing demand for a central university on police sciences. Notwithstanding setting up of such university, 'Police-Chairs' can be established in the social studies centers of various universities.

### **Policing Involvement in the Community**

In Indian police system, policing involvement in the community should be adopted like the US and UK police system. Community- policing initiatives will be a means of countering the crimes by improving the level of contact between police and local people. As far as police involvement in the community is concerned, this would be some reallocation of resources to neighborhood police substations or units. Police work within local areas would be a greater involvement in some forces on inter-agency links. Under the community-policing initiatives, the police role within the neighborhood should be wider and more attuned to the problems faced by residents than simply crime specific and legalistic.

## Summary

The modern police forces of India are the direct descendants of the Indian Colonial Police. The reorganization that took place in early 1860s essentially established the format of the modern Indian police. These reforms established a civil police force. A subcontinent-wide officers' corps was organized, what is now known as Indian Police Service. The provincial or state forces ensure local responsibility and authority. The national officers' corps ensure national standard and identification.

The police of India are charged with multifarious roles as discussed in earlier chapters, but are largely seen as agents for maintenance of law and order and keeping peace.

Although police in India do many helpful, supportive things (in many senses much more than UK and US police), yet it is neither recognized nor appreciated. This can be on various accounts. It is because of public relation problem- police in India have a rather poor public image. There are issues related to perception management also.

Unfortunately, neither the police leadership nor the political leadership has done anything to improve the perception of police in public view. In fact, the poor police perception help other wings of administration and the political leadership finding an easy scapegoat or blame-pusher in police.

Over the years, no political leadership, neither at central level nor at provincial level, has shown grit to bring in reforms in police, that are commensurate to the most modern police of the world. Reforms in police has remained a mere lip service. It is to the credit of police leadership itself that police have still been able to face the emerging challenges and serve the people, irrespective of the perceptions.

In India, police have established specialized units, both under central government and within the provincial government as and when need arose.

In last two decades, there is a concerted effort in increasing the representation of women in the police forces. Recently, by an executive order, 30% reservation has been provided to women in constabulary and sub-inspector level selection by the police forces of Union Territories. The Central Government has also requested the provincial governments to consider extending similar reservation in their police forces.

The police of various provinces are trying to upgrade its equipment. Needless to say, the richer states and more committed states have done better than others. However, the equipment of Indian police are not comparable to that of UK or US police, both, for paucity of fund and non-availability of technology.

Training to the police constabulary and the sub-inspectors are provided by the provincial police training school. It varies in content and quality from state to state. Training for constables is equivalent to post-secondary schooling level and needs lot of improvement.

Training for the officers' corps (IPS) is done centrally at National Police Academy, Hyderabad. It is constantly evolving. However, there is a need for an evidence based training curriculum for officers' corps, too.

Indian Police, like other international police performs the function of social control as well as social integration. The social control function is most clearly represented by the law enforcement activities of the police. The social integration functions of police work, on other hand, is most clearly represented by the support activities of the police, both arbitration-mediation and services.

There are several areas in which the present study of police work in three countries might have implications for future developments in police work. One is the response to and preparation for the support tasks by police. Another is the relationship between policing and the government.

The choices for a future police role in support services are several in theory. Police forces can either continue to play a role in support activities, socially integrative activities, or attempt to abandon this responsibility.

As regards relationship between policing and the government, the US police and Indian Police are at two different ends of the spectrum. While the US police face a severe problem due to complete local autonomy of generalized police forces and the multiplicity of policing agencies on all levels of government; Indian police is unitary force with unified command at the provincial level. Completely autonomous local police agencies lead to incomplete coverage, wide diversity in quality, standards, training, fragmentation, disorganization, duplication of efforts etc. On other hand, carving out specialized police units from within the same unitary force (e.g. Crime against women police, Special Branch Police, Anti-terrorism Police, General purpose police, traffic police etc.) defeats the very purpose. The frequent lateral movement of police officers from unit to other leaves police with no specialization. It is suggested that rationalization of police system into more standardized units with higher governmental influence may be a good hybrid system.

----- XXX -----